Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

# Message Text

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 TEL AV 06492 201615Z

42
ACTION NEA-10

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 NEAE-00 SSM-05 SAM-01 SAJ-01 ACDA-10

IO-13 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-02 INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00

NSC-05 PA-02 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-15 /097 W
---------- 100622
P R 201522Z SEP 76
FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV
TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 3135
INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN
AMEMBASSY CAIRO
AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS
AMCONSUL JERUSALEM
USMISSION SINAI

UNCLAS TEL AVIV 6492

E.O. 11652: N/A
TAGS: PFOR, IS, JO, EG
SUBJECT: REACTION TO ALLON ARTICLE IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS

1. THE PUBLICATION IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS OF THE ARTICLE BY FOREIGN MINISTER ALLON DEALING WITH DEFENSIBLE BORDERS AND OCCUPIED TERRITORIES HAS PREDICTABLY GENERATED A STORM OF MEDIA AND POLITICAL REACTION. THE SUBJECT WAS DISCUSSED AT THE REGULAR WEEKLY CABINET MEETING SEPTEMBER 19 AND WILL BE DEBATED DURING A SPECIAL SESSION OF THE KNESSET SEPTEMBER 21. THE COMMUNIQUE ISSUED BY THE GOVERNMENT PRESS OFFICE AFTER THE CABINET MEETING INCLUDED THE FOLLOWING REMARKS:

2. BEGIN TEXT: MINISTERS YITZHAK RAPHAEL AND ZEVULUN HAMMER ASKED ABOUT THE ARTICLE BY THE DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER AND FOREIGN MINISTER IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS, CONTENDING THAT IT WAS INCONCEIVABLE FOR THE FOREIGN MINISTER TO PUBLISH IN THE FOREIGN PRESS--WITHOUT THE CABINET'S ENDORSEMENT--PERSONAL POLITICAL PLANS OF HIS OWN REGARDING WHICH THERE WERE ESSENTIAL DIFFERENCES OF OPINION WITHIN THE CABINET.
UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 TEL AV 06492 201615Z

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

3. IN REPLY, THE FOREIGN MINISTER EXPLAINED THAT THE PITH OF THE ARTICLE DEALS WITH EXPLANATION OF THE VITAL NECESSITY FOR ISRAEL OF DEFENSIBLE BORDERS--HIS PURPOSE IN THE ARTICLE HAVING BEEN TO ESTABLISH THE ISRAELI ARGUMENT CONCERNING THE INDISPENSABILITY OF DEFENSIBLE BORDERS. MR. ALLON SAID HE HAD BEEN IMPELLED TO WRITE THE ARTICLE IN VIEW OF THE FACT THAT EVEN AMONG ISRAEL'S FRIENDS HE HAD DISCOVERED CONSIDERABLE LACK OF UNDERSTANDING FOR ISRAEL'S FUNDAMENTAL POSITION ON THE ISSUE OF THE STRATEGIC IMPORTANCE OF THE TERRITORIAL CHANGES AND DEFENSIBLE BORDERS, WHICH ARE VITAL FOR THE FUTURE OF ISRAEL'S SECURITY. IN THIS CONNECTION, HE HAD DEEMED IT RIGHT TO REITERATE AND STRESS ISRAEL'S READINESS FOR A TERRITORIAL COMPROMISE, IN THE CONTEXT OF PEACE--THIS, IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE GOVERN-MENT'S POLICY.

4. IN THE ARTICLE, MR. ALLON HAD CAUTIONED AGAINST CREATION OF AN ILLUSION AMONG THE ARAB LEADERS, THAT THE CONFLICT COULD OSTENSIBLY BE RESOLVED WITHOUT ISRAEL HAVING DEFENSIBLE BORDERS--STRESSING ALSO THAT ISRAEL WOULD NOT SUBMIT TO DIKTATS. THE FOREIGN MINISTER ADDED THAT THE MAP APPENDED TO THE ARTICLE HAD BEEN DRAWN WITHOUT HIS APPROVAL OR KNOWLEDGE, AND THAT THE MAGAZINE'S EDITOR HAD APOLOGIZED TO HIM IN THIS REGARD.

5. NO EXACT BORDER LINES HAD BEEN MARKED IN HIS ARTICLE, BUT RATHER THE TERRITORIAL PRINCIPLES IN WHOSE FRAMEWORK IT WAS POSSIBLE--IN HIS VIEW--TO ARRIVE AT DEMARCATION OF DEFENSIBLE BORDERS FOR ISRAEL. MR. ALLON CONCLUDED BY STATING THAT HE HAD NOT ASCRIBED THE NATURE OF AN OFFICIAL DECLARATION TO THE ARTICLE. NO DISCUSSION WAS HELD ON THE SUBJECT. END TEXT.

6. REACTION IN THE PRESS WAS DIVIDED. INDEPENDENT HAARETZ, FOR EXAMPLE, THOUGHT THE PUBLICATION OF THE ARTICLE WAS AN IMPORTANT CONTRIBUTION: "ALLON, WRITING AS SOMEONE WITH A BRILLIANT MILITARY BACKGROUND, HAS THE QUALIFICATIONS TO ARGUE THE IMPORTANCE OF PORTIONS OF TERRITORY FROM THE SECURITY POINT OF VIEW, AND AT THE SAME TIME SUGGESTS THAT THE ISRAELIS ARE NOT INTERESTED IN HOLDING ONTO A LARGE
UNCLASSIFIED



ARAB POPULATIION. SEEN IN THIS LIGHT, THE ARTICLE IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS PLAYS A POSITIVE ROLE, BECAUSE IT DISPLAYS ISRAEL AS BEING PREPARED TO ADOPT REASONABLE STANCES ON POLITICAL ISSUES, AND IS THUS TO BE WELCOMED."

7. THE HISTADRUT'S DAVAR, ON THE OTHER HAND, FELT THAT THE ARTICLE SHOULD NOT HAVE BEEN PUBLISHED, PRIMARILY BECAUSE OF THE TIMING: "DESPITE ITS GOOD INTENTIONS, THE

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

ARTICLE WILL PLEASE NEITHER GUSH EMUNIM, HOSTILE STATES NOR ALLIES, AS FAR AS TIMING IS CONCERNED, ALTHOUGH THE DESIRE TO AVOID A DEADLOCK WHICH MIGHT RESULT IN WAR IS COMMENDABLE, IT IS DOUBTFUL WHETHER SUCH CLEAR EXPRESSIONS OF A READINESS TO GIVE UP PARTICULAR PORTIONS OF TERRITORY AT THIS STAGE IS RELEVANT, IN VIEW OF THE UNFINISHED CIVIL WAR IN LEBANON AND THE U.S. STATE DEPARTMENT'S CURRENT COMMITMENT TO GRADUAL AND PARTIAL SETTLEMENTS."

8. THE MAPAM PAPER, AL HAMISHMAR, PRAISED THE ARTICLE ALTHOUGH IT FELT THE MINISTER'S SUGGESTION FOR TERRITORIES TO BE RETAINED WAS EXCESSIVE. THE NRP'S HATZOFEH ATTACKED THE ARTICLE AND CALLED ON THE GOVERNMENT TO DISOWN IT AND REBUKE ALLON.

9. SEVERAL COMMENTATORS HAVE MADE MUCH OF THE ALLEGATION THAT ALLON PUBLISHED THE ARTICLE WITHOUT HAVING OBTAINED THE APPROVAL OF PRIME MINISTER RABIN. THE INDEPENDENT MAARIV, FOR EXAMPLE, SAID THAT ALLON ERRED IN PUBLISHING IT WITHOUT CONSULTING HIS PRIME MINISTER. MAARIV IS ALSO CRITICAL OF THE TIMING OF THE ARTICLE, SAYING THAT "PUBLICATION OF THE ARTICLE NOW, ON THE EVE OF THE U.N. ASSEMBLY, WAS A VIOLATION OF THE DECISION-NOT-TO-DECIDE, AND IS LIABLE TO CAUSE EMBARRASSMENT TO THE GOVERNMENT. IT IS A POLITICAL AND NOT A PRIVATE ACT, AS SHOWN BY THE IMMEDIATE REACTIONS FROM WASHINGTON AND SOME ARAB CAPITALS." THE INDEPENDENT YEDIOT AHRONOT ALSO CRITICIZED THE TIMING AND SAID, "IF THE ARABS WERE PREPARED TO NEGOTIATE FOR PEACE, ONE COULD UNDERSTAND MR. ALLON'S HASTE IN PRESENTING HIS PLAN, TO SMOOTH NEGOTIATIONS, BUT THERE ARE NO INDICATIONS OF ANY SUCH TRENDS."

10. FORMER FOREIGN MINISTER ABBA EBAN ALSO WAS CRITICAL
UNCLASSIFIED



OF THE ARTICLE, CALLING IT UNWISE AND UNTIMELY. "I AM AFRAID THE PLAN IS SUFFICIENTLY SEVERE TO MAKE THE ARABS RECOIL, AND YET SUFFICIENTLY DETAILED TERRITORIALLY TO OPEN UP A RATHER SUPERFLUOUS TERRITORIAL DEBATE AMONG ISRAELIS."

11. ALLON HIMSELF HAS DEFENDED THE PUBLICATION OF THE ARTICLE. FOR EXAMPLE, IN A TELEVISION INTERVIEW SHOWN SEPTEMBER 17 HE SAID THE FOLLOWING IN RESPONSE TO A QUESTION ABOUT WHAT HE WISHED DR. KISSINGER AND OTHER FOREIGN MINISTERS TO UNDERSTAND FROM THE ARTICLE: "FIRST OF ALL, I WANT ALL OUR FRIENDS IN THE WORLD TO UNDERSTAND THAT ISRAEL CANNOT RETURN TO WHAT IS CALLED THE GREEN LINE, THE BORDERS WHICH EXISTED BEFORE THE SIX DAY WAR. WE CANNOT DO THAT BECAUSE THAT BORDER LACKS STRATEGIC VALUE. SECONDLY,

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

THAT ISRAEL WILL STRUGGLE WITH ALL ITS STRENGTH TO INSURE
THAT WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF PEACE IT WILL KEEP STRATEGIC
DEFENSIVE LINES. THIRDLY, THAT AN ATTEMPT TO ENFORCE A
SOLUTION WHICH IS CONTRARY TO THE SECURITY NEEDS OF ISRAEL
WILL BE REJECTED BY ISRAEL. ALSO IT IS HIGHLY DESIRABLE
THAT NO THIRD PARTY SHOULD SUBMIT SOLUTIONS OF ITS OWN.
THE NEGOTIATIONS ARE BETTER LEFT TO THE PARTIES CONCERNED
BASED ON THE PROPOSALS OF THESE PARTIES."
TOON

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006

# Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994
**Channel Indicators:** n/a
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED
**Concepts:** PRESS COMMENTS, MILITARY OCCUPIED AREAS, FOREIGN POLICY POSITION
**Control Number:** n/a
**Copy:** SINGLE
**Draft Date:** 20 SEP 1976
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960
**Decaption Note:**
**Disposition Action:** n/a
**Disposition Approved on Date:**
**Disposition Authority:** n/a
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a
**Disposition Comment:**
**Disposition Date:** 01 JAN 1960
**Disposition Event:**
**Disposition History:** n/a
**Disposition Reason:**
**Disposition Remarks:**
**Document Number:** 1976TELAV06492
**Document Source:** CORE
**Document Unique ID:** 00
**Drafter:** n/a
**Enclosure:** n/a
**Executive Order:** N/A
**Errors:** N/A
**Film Number:** D760355-0018
**From:** TEL AVIV
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a
**Image Path:**
**ISecure:** 1
**Legacy Key:** link1976/newtext/t19760939/aaaabhwx.tel
**Line Count:** 178
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
**Office:** ACTION NEA
**Original Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a
**Page Count:** 4
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a
**Previous Classification:** n/a
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a
**Reference:** n/a
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED
**Review Authority:** vandyklc
**Review Comment:** n/a
**Review Content Flags:**
**Review Date:** 20 FEB 2004
**Review Event:**
**Review Exemptions:** n/a
**Review History:** RELEASED <20 FEB 2004 by MaustMC>; APPROVED <26 AUG 2004 by vandyklc>
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
04 MAY 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**
**Review Referrals:** n/a
**Review Release Date:** n/a
**Review Release Event:** n/a
**Review Transfer Date:**
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a
**Secure:** OPEN
**Status:** NATIVE
**Subject:** REACTION TO ALLON ARTICLE IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS
**TAGS:** PFOR, IS, JO, EG, (ALLON, YIGAL)
**To:** STATE
**Type:** TE
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006